

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF ALABAMA  
SOUTHERN DIVISION**

**IN RE: BLUE CROSS BLUE SHIELD  
ANTITRUST LITIGATION** }  
**(MDL No.: 2406)** }

Master File No.:2:13-CV-20000-RDP

This document relates to Subscriber cases.

**SUBSCRIBER PLAINTIFFS' MOTION FOR PARTIAL SUMMARY JUDGMENT  
ON THE APPLICATION OF THE *PER SE* RULE**

Subscriber Plaintiffs hereby move, pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 56, that this Court should hold that the restrictions on competition agreed to by the Member Plans are subject to a rule of *per se* illegality. In support of this Motion, Subscriber Plaintiffs rely on the simultaneously filed “Memorandum of Points and Authorities in Support of Subscriber Plaintiffs’ Motion for Partial Summary Judgment on the Application of the *Per Se* Rule,” including the supporting exhibits attached thereto.

Dated: July 17, 2017

Respectfully submitted,

Charles J. Cooper – *Co-Chair, Written Submissions Committee*  
COOPER & KIRK, PLLC  
1523 New Hampshire Avenue NW  
Washington, DC 20036  
Tel: (202) 220-9600  
Fax: (202) 220-9601  
[ccooper@cooperkirk.com](mailto:ccooper@cooperkirk.com)

/s/ David J. Guin  
David Guin – ***Co-Chair, Written Submissions Committee***  
Tammy Stokes – ***Damages Committee***  
GUIN, STOKES & EVANS, LLC  
The Financial Center  
505 20th Street North, Suite 1000  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 226-2282  
Fax: (205) 226-2357  
[davidg@gseattorneys.com](mailto:davidg@gseattorneys.com)  
[tammys@gseattorneys.com](mailto:tammys@gseattorneys.com)

David Boies – ***Co-Lead Counsel***  
BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP  
333 Main Street  
Armonk, NY 10504  
Tel: (914) 749-8200  
Fax: (914) 749-8200  
[dboies@bsflp.com](mailto:dboies@bsflp.com)

Chris T. Hellums – ***Local Facilitating Counsel***  
PITTMAN, DUTTON & HELLUMS, P.C.  
2001 Park Place N, 1100 Park Place Tower  
Birmingham, AL 35203  
Tel: (205) 322-8880  
Fax: (205) 328-2711  
[chrish@pittmandutton.com](mailto:chrish@pittmandutton.com)

Gregory Davis – ***Settlement Committee & PSC Member***  
DAVIS & TALIAFERRO, LLC  
7031 Halcyon Park Drive  
Montgomery, AL 36117  
Tel: (334) 832-9080  
Fax: (334) 409-7001  
[gldavis@knology.net](mailto:gldavis@knology.net)

Kathleen Chavez – ***Settlement Committee & PSC Member***  
FOOTE, MIELKE, CHAVEZ & O'NEIL,  
LLC  
10 West State Street, Suite 200  
Geneva, IL 60134  
Tel: (630) 797-3339  
Fax: (630) 232-7452  
[kcc@fmcolaw.com](mailto:kcc@fmcolaw.com)

Michael Hausfeld – ***Co-Lead Counsel***  
HAUSFELD LLP  
1700 K Street NW, Suite 650  
Washington, DC 20006  
Tel: (202) 540-7200  
Fax: (202) 540-7201  
[mhausfeld@hausfeldllp.com](mailto:mhausfeld@hausfeldllp.com)

William A. Isaacson – ***Settlement Committee & PSC Member***  
BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP  
5301 Wisconsin Avenue NW  
Washington, DC 20015  
Tel: (202) 237-2727  
Fax: (202) 237-6131  
[wisaacson@bsflp.com](mailto:wisaacson@bsflp.com)

Megan Jones – ***Settlement Committee & PSC Member***  
Arthur Bailey – ***Discovery Committee***  
HAUSFELD LLP  
600 Montgomery Street, Suite 3200  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Tel: (415) 633-1908  
Fax: (415) 358-4980  
[mjones@hausfeldllp.com](mailto:mjones@hausfeldllp.com)  
[abailey@hausfeldllp.com](mailto:abailey@hausfeldllp.com)

Cyril V. Smith – ***Settlement Committee & PSC Member***  
ZUCKERMAN SPAEDER, LLP  
100 East Pratt Street, Suite 2440  
Baltimore, MD 21202-1031  
Tel: (410) 949-1145  
Fax: (410) 659-0436  
[csmith@zuckerman.com](mailto:csmith@zuckerman.com)

Eric L. Cramer – ***Expert Committee***  
BERGER & MONTAGUE, P.C.  
1622 Locust Street  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Tel: 1-800-424-6690  
Fax: (215) 875-4604  
[ecramer@bm.net](mailto:ecramer@bm.net)

Patrick Cafferty – ***Discovery Committee***  
CAFFERTY CLOBES MERIWETHER &  
SPRENGEL LLP  
101 North Main Street, Suite 565  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
Tel: (734) 769-2144  
Fax: (734) 769-1207  
[pcafferty@caffertyclobes.com](mailto:pcafferty@caffertyclobes.com)

Douglas Dellaccio – ***Litigation Committee***  
CORY WATSON CROWDER & DEGARIS,  
P.C.  
2131 Magnolia Avenue, Suite 200  
Birmingham, AL 32505  
Tel: (205) 328-2200  
Fax: (205) 324-7896  
[ddellaccio@cwcd.com](mailto:ddellaccio@cwcd.com)

Edwin J. Kilpela, Jr.  
Benjamin Sweet – ***Litigation Committee***  
DEL SOLE CAVANAUGH STROYD LLC  
200 First Avenue, Suite 300  
Pittsburgh, PA 15222  
Tel: (412) 261-2393  
Fax: (412) 261-2110  
[ekilpela@dsclaw.com](mailto:ekilpela@dsclaw.com)  
[bsweet@dsclaw.com](mailto:bsweet@dsclaw.com)

Richard Feinstein – ***Expert Committee***  
Karen Dyer – ***Expert Committee***  
Hamish P.M. Hume – ***Discovery Committee***  
BOIES, SCHILLER & FLEXNER LLP  
5301 Wisconsin Avenue NW  
Washington, DC 20015  
Tel: (202) 237-2727  
Fax: (202) 237-6131  
[tchutkan@bsflp.com](mailto:tchutkan@bsflp.com)  
[kdyer@bsflp.com](mailto:kdyer@bsflp.com)  
[hhume@bsflp.com](mailto:hhume@bsflp.com)

Bryan Clobes – ***Litigation Committee***  
Ellen Meriwether – ***Written Submissions Committee***  
CAFFERTY CLOBES MERIWETHER &  
SPRENGEL LLP  
1101 Market Street, Suite 2650  
Philadelphia, PA 19107  
Tel: (215) 864-2800  
Fax: (215) 864-2810  
[bclobes@caffertyclobes.com](mailto:bclobes@caffertyclobes.com)  
[emeriwether@caffertyclobes.com](mailto:emeriwether@caffertyclobes.com)

Chris Cowan – ***Damages Committee***  
THE COWAN LAW FIRM  
209 Henry Street  
Dallas, TX 74226-1819  
Tel: (214) 826-1900  
Fax: (214) 826-8900  
[chris@cowanlaw.net](mailto:chris@cowanlaw.net)

Robert M. Foote – ***Damages Committee***  
FOOTE, MIELKE, CHAVEZ & O'NEIL, LLC  
10 West State Street, Suite 200  
Geneva, IL 60134  
Tel: (630) 797-3339  
Fax: (630) 232-7452  
[rmf@fmcolaw.com](mailto:rmf@fmcolaw.com)

Charles T. Caliendo – ***Class Certification Committee***  
GRANT & EISENHOFER  
485 Lexington Avenue  
New York, NY 10017  
Tel: (646) 722-8500  
Fax: (646) 722-8501  
[ccaliendo@gelaw.com](mailto:ccaliendo@gelaw.com)

Daniel Gustafson – ***Litigation Committee***  
Daniel C. Hedlund – ***Damages Committee***  
GUSTAFSON GLUEK PLLC  
120 South Sixth Street, Suite 2600  
Minneapolis, MN 55402  
Tel: (612) 333-8844  
Fax: (612) 339-6622  
[dgustafson@gustafsongluek.com](mailto:dgustafson@gustafsongluek.com)  
[dhedlund@gustafsongluek.com](mailto:dhedlund@gustafsongluek.com)

John Saxon – ***Litigation Committee***  
JOHN D. SAXON, P.C.  
2119 3rd Avenue North  
Birmingham, AL 35203-3314  
Tel: (205) 324-0223  
Fax: (205) 323-1583  
[jsaxon@saxonattorneys.com](mailto:jsaxon@saxonattorneys.com)

Andrew Lemmon – ***Chair, Discovery Committee***  
LEMMON LAW FIRM  
650 Poydras Street, Suite 2335  
New Orleans, LA 70130  
Tel: (504) 581-5644  
Fax: (504) 581-2156  
[andrew@lemonnlawfirm.com](mailto:andrew@lemonnlawfirm.com)

Robert Eisler – ***Discovery Committee***  
GRANT & EISENHOFER  
123 Justison Street  
Wilmington, DE 19801  
Tel: (302) 622-7000  
Fax: (302) 622-7100  
[reisler@gelaw.com](mailto:reisler@gelaw.com)

Brent Hazzard – ***Litigation Committee***  
HAZZARD LAW, LLC  
447 Northpark Drive  
Ridgeland, MS 39157  
Tel: (601) 977-5253  
Fax: (601) 977-5236  
[brenthazzard@yahoo.com](mailto:brenthazzard@yahoo.com)

Lawrence Jones – ***Damages Committee***  
JONES WARD PLC  
312 South Fourth Street, Sixth Floor  
Louisville, KY 40202  
Tel: (502) 882-6000  
[larry@jonesward.com](mailto:larry@jonesward.com)

Virginia Buchanan – ***Chair, Class Certification Committee***  
LEVIN PAPANTONIO THOMAS  
MITCHELL RAFFERTY & PROCTOR, P.A.  
316 South Baylen Street, Suite 600  
Pensacola, FL 32502  
Tel: (850) 435-7000  
Fax: (850) 435-7020  
[vbuchanan@levinlaw.com](mailto:vbuchanan@levinlaw.com)

Robert Methvin – ***Chair, Settlement Committee***  
James M. Terrell – ***Class Certification Committee***  
MCCALLUM, METHVIN & TERRELL, P.C.  
The Highland Building  
2201 Arlington Avenue South  
Birmingham, AL 35205  
Tel: (205) 939-0199  
Fax: (205) 939-0399  
[rgm@mmlaw.net](mailto:rgm@mmlaw.net)  
[jterrell@mmlaw.net](mailto:jterrell@mmlaw.net)

H. Lewis Gillis – ***Co-Head Chair, Litigation Committee***  
MEANS GILLIS LAW, LLC  
3121 Zelda Court  
Montgomery, AL 36106  
Tel: 1-800-626-9684  
[hlgillis@tmgslaw.com](mailto:hlgillis@tmgslaw.com)

Dianne M. Nast – ***Class Certification Committee***  
NASTLAW LLC  
1101 Market Street, Suite 2801  
Philadelphia, PA 19107  
Tel: (215) 923-9300  
Fax: (215) 923-9302  
[dnast@nastlaw.com](mailto:dnast@nastlaw.com)

Edgar D. Gankendorff – ***Co-Head Chair, Litigation Committee***  
Eric R.G. Belin – ***Damages Committee***  
PROVOSTY & GANKENDORFF, LLC  
650 Poydras Street, Suite 2700  
New Orleans, LA 70130  
Tel: (504) 410-2795  
Fax: (504) 410-2796  
[egankendorff@provostylaw.com](mailto:egankendorff@provostylaw.com)  
[ebelin@provostylaw.com](mailto:ebelin@provostylaw.com)

Michael McGartland – ***Class Certification Committee***  
MCGARTLAND & BORCHARDT LLP  
1300 South University Drive, Suite 500  
Fort Worth, TX 76107  
Tel: (817) 332-9300  
Fax: (817) 332-9301  
[mike@attorneysmb.com](mailto:mike@attorneysmb.com)

David J. Hodge – ***Chair, Settlement Committee***  
MORRIS, KING & HODGE  
200 Pratt Avenue NE  
Huntsville, AL 35801  
Tel: (256) 536-0588  
Fax: (256) 533-1504  
[lstewart@alinjurylaw.com](mailto:lstewart@alinjurylaw.com)

Patrick W. Pendley – ***Chair, Damages Committee***  
Christopher Coffin – ***State Liaison Committee***  
PENDLEY, BAUDIN & COFFIN, LLP  
Post Office Drawer 71  
Plaquemine, LA 70765  
Tel: (225) 687-6369  
[pwpendley@pbclawfirm.com](mailto:pwpendley@pbclawfirm.com)  
[ccoffin@pbclawfirm.com](mailto:ccoffin@pbclawfirm.com)

Richard Rouco – ***Written Submissions Committee***  
QUINN, CONNOR, WEAVER, DAVIES & ROUCO LLP  
2700 Highway 280 East, Suite 380  
Birmingham, AL 35223  
Tel: (205) 870-9989  
Fax: (205) 870-9989  
[rrouco@qcwdr.com](mailto:rrouco@qcwdr.com)

Garrett Blanchfield – ***Written Submissions Committee***  
REINHARDT, WENDORF &  
BLANCHFIELD  
E-1250 First National Bank Building  
332 Minnesota Street  
St. Paul, MN 55101  
Tel: (651) 287-2100  
Fax: (651) 287-2103  
[g.blanchfield@rwblawfirm.com](mailto:g.blanchfield@rwblawfirm.com)

Larry McDevitt – ***Chair, Class Certification Committee***  
David Wilkerson – ***Discovery Committee***  
VAN WINKLE LAW FIRM  
11 North Market Street  
Asheville, NC 28801  
Tel: (828) 258-2991  
[lmcdevitt@vwlawfirm.com](mailto:lmcdevitt@vwlawfirm.com)  
[dwilkerson@vwlawfirm.com](mailto:dwilkinson@vwlawfirm.com)

Jason Thompson – ***Damages Committee***  
SOMMERS SCHWARTZ  
One Towne Square, 17th Floor  
Southfield, MI 48076  
Tel: (248) 355-0300  
[jthompson@sommerspc.com](mailto:jthompson@sommerspc.com)

Carl S. Kravitz – ***Expert Committee***  
ZUCKERMAN SPAEDER LLP  
1800 M Street NW, Suite 1000  
Washington, DC 20036-5807  
Tel: (202) 778-1800  
Fax: (202) 822-8106  
[c.kravitz@zuckerman.com](mailto:c.kravitz@zuckerman.com)

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on this the 17th day of July, 2017, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of Court using the CM/ECF filing system, which will send a copy to all counsel of record.

*/s/ Chris T. Hellums* \_\_\_\_\_  
Chris T. Hellums  
*Local Facilitating Counsel for Subscriber*  
*Plaintiffs*